An Introduction to Indian Literary Theory Dr. Sreenath VS Humanities and Social Sciences Indian Institute of Science Education and Research - Bhopal Lecture- 48 Theory of Dosa or Poetic Blemish: Vamana's View

Hello everyone,

In the previous lectures, we saw the theory of dosa conceptualized by Dandin.

The next major theoretician we are going to see vis-à-vis the concept of doșa is Vāmana. When it comes to Vāmana, the idea of doșa becomes an important category. According to Vāmana, the term doșa refers to the absence of guṇas. He says, "gunāviparyātmano doṣaḥ". Vāmana divides the idea of doṣa under four major categories namely *pada*, *padārtha*, vākya and vākyārtha. The word pada refers to the word, padartha is the meaning of a word. Vākya means sentence and vākyārtha means the sentence meaning.

Vāmana enumerates five pada doşas first. The pada doşas mentioned by Vāmana includes asādhu, kaşţa, grāmya, apratīta, and anarthaka . Let us take a look at these five doşas in detail. The first doşa is asādhu. Asādhu is the use of ungrammatical usage. According to Vāmana, the employment of ungrammatical usages can adversely affect the poetic charm. This doşa is very much similar to Bhāmaha's śabdahīna. The next pada doşa that Vāmana deals with is kaşţa. What is kaşţa? Kaşţa is the employment of words that are not soothing to the ears. This is also called duḥśrava. The next doşa is grāmya. Grāmya is the employment of words that are uncultured and unsophisticated. It is the use of the popular usages. The next doşa apratīta is the exact opposite of grāmya. It is the use of words that are found only in śāstra. Anarthaka is the use of an avyaya or indeclinable just for the sake of conforming to the ornamentation of the sentence will not fall under this category. According to Vāmana, these words which are used ineffectively for the sake of retaining the metrical pattern in the composition reveals the lack of the genius of the poets.

After this, Vāmana goes on to list the padārtha doşas or poetic defects pertaining to the meaning of words. According to Vāmana, there are five padārtha doşas, namely anyārtha,

neyārtha, gūdārtha, aślīlārtha and klistārtha. First, let us take a look at the dosa called anyārtha. This is a deviation from the *prasiddhartha* or the popular meaning of a word. If a poet discards the popular meaning of the word and goes for the obsolete etymological meaning, then the dosa anyārtha will arise. The next padārtha dosa is nevārtha. If the readers have to guess the meaning of a sentence, then there is the dosa called nevartha. After, neyārtha, Vāmana describes the doşa called, gūdārtha. What is gūdārtha? A word has got two kinds of meanings-- popular meaning and less-known meanings. If the poet uses a word in such a manner that it signifies the lesser-known meaning, then the poet is said to have committed the doşa called gūdārtha. The next doşa is aślīlārtha . Aślīlārtha is the employment of words that can generate obscene meaning. Vāmana says that there are three kinds of asililatas or indecorous meanings, namely the meaning which gives rise to shame, the meaning which gives rise to disgust, and finally, meaning that forebodes evil. Vamana exempts some meanings from the ambit of obscenity. According to him, if the word generates an obscene sense only through its metaphorical or secondary usage, then it cannot be considered an instance of aslīlata or obscenity. Similarly, some words will drive home to our mind the resonance of some other words that signify an obscene meaning. These words, if they are accepted by the cultured people, also cannot be considered to have the dosa aślīlata. Finally, Vāmana is of the view that if the aślīla or the obscene meaning of the word is not so popular, there is no problem in using that particular word in poetry. The next dosa that Vāmana talks about is klista. If the meaning of a word is not fully revealed, then it is called klista. According to Vāmana, the last two *dosas*, that is aslilata and klista, are applicable to the vākya or the sentence as well.

After explaining these two categories, Vāmana goes on to describe the third variety which is vākya doşa or the poetic faults pertaining to the sentence. We have already seen that aślīlata and klişta are the defects that pertain to the sentence as well. Now, Vāmana talks about the remaining three doşas which include bhinnavrtta, yatibhrṣta and visandhi. Yatibhrṣta is the fault of deviation from the rules of metrical pause. If the poet starts a verse in one vrtta or meter, then changes the vrtta in the middle of the same verse, then it is the dosa called bhinnavrtta. At this juncture, Vāmana anticipates an objection. He says that an opponent may now say that yatibhrṣta and bhinnavrtta are the same. Vāmana says that this is not a correct observation. Vāmana says, "This however is not correct, as the distinctive features of the two are totally different. In other words, "The characteristics of meter' are entirely different from

those of 'pause' or 'yati'. While the meter consists of the arrangement of long and short syllables, the pause consists in the resting of the voice of on certain syllable.

The next doşa that Vāmana mentions is visandhi. Visandhi is the cacophony generating from the placing of dissimilar words beside each other in a sentence. According to Vāmana, the doşa called visandhi arises when the collusion of words is unmelodious or inharmonious in a sentence.

After this, Vāmana goes on to explain the vākyārtha doşa or the poetic fault related to the sentence meaning. The first vākyārtha doşa that Vāmana mentions is ekārtha. We know that ekārtha is tautology or punarukti. Vāmana says that this is not a doşa, if the poet wants to achieve something special through the repetition. After ekārtha, Vāmana talks about vyartha. vyartha is the presence of conflicting meanings. Since, we have already seen this fault in the previous classes, I do not intend to repeat it. If a sentence generates confusion with respect to its meaning, then there arises the doşa called *sannigdha*. The next doşa is aprayukta. What is aprayukta? According to Vāmana, aprayukta is that sentence where the signification attached to the sentence is purely illusory or imaginary. Although Vāmana says that the examples of this doşa are abundant, he does not mention them. The next poetic fault is apakrama. Apakrama is the absence of order. We have already seen this category in detail previously. So, I think it does not require further explanation.

The penultimate doşa is loka virodha. According to Vāmana, that which is opposed to the ordinary conceptions of place, time and nature are called loka virodha. Here, under the doşa called lokavirodha, Vāmana subsumes the two doşas, namely kālavirodha and deśavirodha, mentioned by Bhāmaha. The last doşa mentioned by Vāmana is vidyāvirudha. The doşa or poetic fault that he refers to as vidyāvirudha is opposition to the dictates in the śāstras. Vāmana opines that any representation of facts against what is written in *śāstras* will be a blotch on *kāvya*. To demonstrate the poetic blemish called *vidyāvirudham* and warn the poet against it, Vāmana cites a few examples. According to *dharmaśāstra*, it is to restore justice that kings conquer the world. If a poet says that it is to satiate their material desires that kings win over countries, that will result in a poetic blemish. According to *Dandaśāstranīti*, it is because of a person's prudent conduct and diplomacy that others succumb to him/her. But if somebody says that it is a person's aggressiveness that enables him to win over others, then it clashes with the socially accepted norm of *Dandaśāstranīti* and consequently results in the

poetic blemish of contradicting *caturvarga-śāstra*. He gives another example which is at war with $K\bar{a}mas\bar{a}stra$. According to $K\bar{a}mas\bar{a}stra$, lower lip (*adhara*) is the right place to kiss, not the upper lip (*uttarostha*). Contrary to this dictum in $K\bar{a}mas\bar{a}stra$, if a poet states that the upper lip is the right place to kiss, the poet will court a poetic blemish.

These are the major dosas mentioned by Vamana. When it comes to Vamana, the scope of the idea of dosa slowly gets enhanced.