

Advanced Topics in Probability and Random Processes
Prof. P. K. Bora
Department of Electrical Engineering
Indian Institute of Technology, Guwahati

Lecture – 06
Infinite Sequence of Events-II

(Refer Slide Time: 00:32)

$$\begin{aligned}\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j \\ \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j \\ \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &\subseteq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n \\ \text{If } \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = A \\ A &\text{ is called the limit of the sequence } \{A_n\}\end{aligned}$$

So, we will continue with Infinite Sequence of Events. We talked about two limits $\limsup A_n$ that is equal to intersection n is equal to 1 to infinity union A_j , j is equal to n to infinity. Similarly, we define $\liminf A_n$, n tends to infinity that is the union of n from n is equal to 1 to infinity of the intersection A_j , j going from n to infinity.

So, these two limits are generally not equal and we have discussed that this $\limsup \liminf$ of A_n is a subset of \limsup of A_n . And if this two limits are equal, then we say that this sequence A_n has a limit and that limit is an event suppose and will be given by this \liminf of A_n equal to \limsup of A_n is equal to A that is if the limit exists \liminf of A_n as n tends to infinity is equal to \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity is equal to A suppose, then A is called the limit, A is called the limit of this sequence of events A_n ok.

(Refer Slide Time: 03:16)

Example 1

Suppose the sequence of events with $\{A_n\}$ is given by

$$A_n = \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}, 2 + \frac{1}{n}\right)$$

$$\therefore \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k$$

$$= \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n, \text{ where } B_n = \bigcup_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k$$

$$B_n = \bigcup_{k=n}^{\infty} \left(1 + \frac{1}{k}, 2 + \frac{1}{k}\right) = \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}, 2 + \frac{1}{n}\right)$$

$$\therefore \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}, 2 + \frac{1}{n}\right) = (1, 2]$$




With define \limsup of A_n and \liminf of A_n ; let us see one example. Suppose A_n is equal to it is an open interval from $1 + \frac{1}{n}$ to $2 + \frac{1}{n}$. So, first we will find out \limsup of A_n . So, let us call this event as B_n , then \limsup of A_n is the intersection of B_n , this B_n is a decreasing sequence. So, B_n is given by this union k is equal to n to infinity of the interval $1 + \frac{1}{k}$ to $2 + \frac{1}{k}$. So, we see that a first element of this interval, suppose, if I consider the sequence. So, B_n will be; so, we have defined B_n like this.

So, B_n ; if we carry out suppose first element this and that is one; this is suppose 1, this is 2, then $1 + \frac{1}{n}$. So, this is suppose $1 + \frac{1}{n}$ and upper limit is $2 + \frac{1}{n}$. So, this is suppose 2, this is 1, this is 2. So, this is suppose $2 + \frac{1}{n}$. Now if I consider the union, then $2 + \frac{1}{n}$. So, as n tends to infinity this $2 + \frac{1}{n}$ will come to the left and this one also $1 + \frac{1}{n}$ also come to the left. So, that way we can find out this limit, this is equal to 1, suppose if we have as n tends to infinity that interval will be increasing.

So, we will have $1 + \frac{1}{n}$ to $2 + \frac{1}{n}$ that as the limit open interval. So, now, we have to take the intersection of this sequence of events. So, if I take the intersection, so, it is 1 and then $2 + \frac{1}{n}$. So, as and when as increasing as n is increasing, so, this sequence will become smaller and smaller and we will have the limit that is a semi open interval 1

2 with closed closer at right hand side. So, it is a semi interval semi open interval which is closed at the right hand side.

(Refer Slide Time: 06:09)

$$\begin{aligned}
 \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j \\
 C_n &= \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j \\
 &= \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} \left(1 + \frac{1}{j}, 2 + \frac{1}{j} \right) \\
 &= \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}, 2 \right] \\
 \therefore \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}, 2 \right] \\
 &= (1, 2] \\
 \therefore \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n &= \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n
 \end{aligned}$$


So, that way we got the lim sup of A_n ; similarly, we can find out the lim inf of A_n . Now this is by definition this is the union of this intersection and this intersection if we call as C_n , this intersection we will call as C_n . So, then C_n will be an increasing sequence; therefore, we can find out limit that way we define the limit.

So, similarly, like the like in the previous case, here also first element will be suppose 1 here, 1 plus 1 by n because it is starting from n and this is the first point suppose first left hand side, right hand side is 2, this is 2, suppose 2 plus 1 by n 2 plus 1 by n, now we will take in the intersection of this sequence. So, for different n; now this will come left hand side.

And this one also will come to the left hand side and if I take the intersection of all the intervals considered, then we will get this semi open interval one 1 by n 1 plus 1 by n 2 with which is closed at the right hand side. And the now we have to find out the union of union of C_n . So, if I take the union of these intervals for n is equal to 1 to infinity, I will get again a semi open interval 1 2 which is closed at the right hand side. So, in this case we have said that lim inf is 1 2 interval 1 to 2 and lim sup A_n also interval 1 to 2.

So, that the limit exists here limit of this sequence exists and the limit is $\frac{1}{2}$ interval 1 to 2. So, we have defined two limits \limsup of A_n and \liminf of A_n and \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity.

(Refer Slide Time: 08:31)

$$P\left(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right) \quad P\left(\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right)$$

And we have defined two limits \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity and \liminf of A_n as n tends to infinity. Now we can apply the continuity theorem to find out the probability of these two events, how to find out the probability of this event, suppose and probability of these events. So, that because now these limits are limits of some a monotone sequence, therefore, we can apply the continuity theorem.

(Refer Slide Time: 09:24)

$$P(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) \text{ and } P(\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n)$$

Applying the continuity theorem,

$$\begin{aligned} P(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) &= P\left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j\right) \\ &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\left(\bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j\right) \end{aligned}$$

and

$$P(\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) = P\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k\right) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\left(\bigcap_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k\right)$$

So, we want to find out the probability of \limsup of A_n and probability of \liminf of A_n . So, we will apply the continuity theorem; so, probability of \limsup of A_n that is the probability of this sequence intersection from n is equal to 1 to infinity of the union is A_j is equal to n to infinity.

Now, I know that this sequence is a decreasing sequence. So, for the decreasing sequence, we can apply the continuity theorem. So, this limit probability of this limiting event is equal to limit of this probability of union of A_j , j equal to n to infinity. So, that way we can find out the \limsup of A_n and similarly we can find out probability of \liminf of A_n that is by definition probability of union n is equal to 1 to infinity of the intersection A_k , k is equal to k is equal to n to infinity.

Now, I know that this event this sequence of event if I consider this, this is an increasing sequence. Therefore, for this also we can apply the continuity theorem and therefore, this limit probability of this limiting event will become limit of the probability of intersection A_k k going from n to infinity. So, that way we can find out the probability of the limiting events \limsup of A_n and probability of the \liminf of A_n as n tends to infinity.

(Refer Slide Time: 11:22)

Theorem $P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k\right) \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P(A_k)$

Proof: Consider the event $B_n = \bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k$, an increasing sequence of events

and $\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k = \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} B_k$

Now, $P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k\right) = P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} B_k\right)$


$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P(B_n) \quad \because \{B_n\} \text{ is increasing}$

$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k\right)$

$\leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=1}^n P(A_k) = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P(A_k)$

Handwritten notes:

- $P(A \cup B) \leq P(A) + P(B)$
- $P\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^n A_i\right) \leq \sum_{i=1}^n P(A_i)$ *Bull's inequality*
- $P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k\right) \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P(A_k)$



We will establish one important theorem. We know that suppose in a simple case probability of A union B is less than equal to probability of A plus probability of B and A general form of this theorem is probability of; suppose if I consider A union of A i, i going from 1 to n. So, this we can establish through mathematical induction that this is less than equal to summation of P of A i i is equal to 1 to n, this inequality is known as the bulls inequality bulls inequality. So, similar to that now we can establish on inequality for the infinite sequence here it is a finite sequence.

So, we applied the principle of mathematical induction and we can establish this, but how to prove this probability of union A k k going from 1 to infinity is less than the infinite sum of the probability of A k sequence k going from 1 to infinity let us consider the event B n is equal to union A k k going from 1 to infinity 1 to n.

So, it is a sequence in terms of n. So, it is B n is a sequence in it is an increasing sequence because when I consider B of n plus 1 this union will go up to n plus 1 that way it is in increasing sequence of events, we also observe that union of A k k going from one to n this is same as A union of B k because this B n, we have defined as the nested union of nested events. So, that way it is same as union of B k, k going from 1 to A n therefore, if I have to consider the infinity sequence then this infinite union of A k will be same infinite union of B k sequence.

Now, let us find out this probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to infinity. So, this probability is same as the probability of the event union of B_k , k going from 1 to infinity. Now this is an increasing sequence of event, therefore, we can apply the continuity theorem. So, this will be same as limit of the B_n because this B_k sequence, it is a like B_1 , this is about $B_1 B_2$ like that; this is a increasing sequence of events suppose, this is B_n then this probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to infinity.

This is same as probability of union of B_k , k going from 1 to infinity and this is if I apply the continuity theorem this is same as probability limit of the probability B_n as n tends to infinity. So, what we got therefore, this left hand side is equal to limit of probability of B_n as n tends to infinity. Now probability of B_n is same as probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to n . Therefore, this left hand side is same as limit n tends to infinity probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to n

So, now here we can apply the Boole's inequality. So, we can write less than equal to limit n tends to infinity probability of A_k , k is equal to 1 to n . And now this n going to infinity that will come here. So, this is the notation. So, we can write that probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to infinity that is less than equal to probability of A_k , k going from 1 to infinity. So, what we have establish probability of union of A_k , k going from 1 to infinity. This infinite union countably infinite union that is less than equal to the infinite sum of the individual probabilities; k is equal to 1 to infinity.

(Refer Slide Time: 16:37)

Thus,

$$P\left(\bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k\right) \leq \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P(A_k)$$

We can similarly prove,

$$P\left(\bigcup_{k=m}^{\infty} A_k\right) \leq \sum_{k=m}^{\infty} P(A_k)$$

So, this result, we have established. We can also show that similar way, we can show that this result. Here it is k is equal to k going from 1 to infinity, but we can start with any m k equal to m , then this union of this sequence also probability of union of A_k , k going from m to infinity that will be less than equal to the infinite sum of the probability sequence probability of A_k k going from m to infinity.

So, we established one important result and the corollary of this result is this. So, first result is this that probability of infinite union of any sequence of events is always less than equal to the sum of the that infinite sum of the corresponding probability sequence and the corollary is if we start from k is equal to m , then also this inequality is satisfy.

(Refer Slide Time: 17:53)

Theorem Borrel Cantelli lemmas: Let $\{A_n\}$ be a sequence of events in (S, F, P) .

(a) If $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P(A_n) < \infty$ then $P\left(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right) = P(A_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$

(b) If the events in $\{A_n\}$ are mutually independent and $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P(A_n) = \infty$, then $P\left(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right) = P(A_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$

Now, we will discuss on important theorem it has two parts and they are known as Borrel Cantelli lemmas, this theorem tells about the probability of this event \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity also we know that it is the event of those sample points which occurs in A and for infinitely many n . So, that we added A_n infinitely often now let us state the theorem let A_n be a sequence of events in S, P, F ; that is probability space S of P . Now if summation P of A_n and going from 1 to infinity is less than infinity that is it is convergent this series is convergent then probability of \limsup of A_n is equal to 0.

So, if this sum is less than infinity, then this probability will be always equal to 0. Now part B if the events a and r mutually independent this is a requirement for part B events in A_n are mutually independent and the sum of this probability of A_n , n going from 1 to

infinity that diverges that is equal to infinity means at that diverges then probability of $\limsup A_n$ is equal to 1. So, these two lemmas are very important as far as application is concerned.

(Refer Slide Time: 19:34)

Proof (a):

$$\begin{aligned}
 P\left(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right) &= P\left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j\right) \\
 &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\left(\bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j\right) \\
 &\leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=n}^{\infty} P(A_j) = 0
 \end{aligned}$$

decreasing sequence of event

$\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P(A_j) < \infty$

$P\left(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n\right) = 0$

Next we will prove this two lemmas we will first consider part a probability of \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity by definition that is equal to probability of the intersection n going from 1 to infinity of the union of events either they starting with n to infinity.

Now, I know that this sequence union A_j , j going from n to infinity this sequence this part is decreasing sequence. So, this is a decreasing sequence of event. So, because of that we can apply the continuity theorem events. So, this is same as probability a limit of the probability of union is A_j , j going from n to infinity as n tends to infinity. So, this we got by using the continuity theorem and now we apply the earlier inequality we developed. So, therefore, this is A union this union is less than equal to the sum of the respective probabilities as n tends to infinity.

So, limit n tends to infinity of the sum P of A_j , j going from n to infinity now we are given that summation of P of A_j , j going from 1 to infinity is convergent it is less than infinity. Therefore, if it is a converging series then any tail sum if we consider; so, that tails sum will become 0. Therefore, this sum probability of A_j , j going from n to infinity this sum is equal to 0

So, therefore, what we have established that if this happens then probability of $\limsup A_n$ as n tends to infinity. So, probability of these limiting events will be always equal to 0. So, this result this is the part a of Borrel Cantelli lemma.

(Refer Slide Time: 22:10)

Proof (b): Suppose $A = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j$

$$A^c = \left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k \right)^c = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{k=n}^{\infty} A_k^c \quad \text{De Morgan's}$$

$$\therefore P(A^c) = P\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j^c \right)$$

$$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\left(\bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j^c \right) \quad (\text{By the continuity theorem})$$

$$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \prod_{j=n}^{\infty} P(A_j^c) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \prod_{k=n}^{\infty} (1 - P(A_k))$$

We will prove the part b. So, here we have we have considered sequence of independent events now the event $\limsup A_n$ as n tends to infinity let us call this event as a suppose. So, we want to show that probability of this event $P(A)$ is equal to 1.

So, we will consider the complement of this event a complement. So, probability of this complement should be equal to 0 if we can prove that $P(A^c)$ is equal to 0, then probability of A will be equal to 1. So, we are defining a complement as the complement of this intersection n going from 1 to infinity of the event union of event A_k , k going from n to infinity. Now we have to take the complement. So, we can apply De Morgan law. So, we will get that this will be this intersection will become union n union will become intersection and this will be A_j^c complement here also this will be $k A_k$.

So, probability of a complement is probability of union n going from 1 to infinity of the infinite intersection of A_j^c complement j are going from n to infinity. So, this is the probability a complement that is equal to probability of union n going from 1 to infinity and intersection of A_j , j going from n to infinity intersection of A_j^c complement j going from n to infinity.

Now, this intersection sequence this is an increasing sequence, therefore, we can apply the continuity theorem again; so, this will be same as limit n tends to infinity probability of this event that is intersection of A_j complement j going from n to infinity, we have assumed that the events are independent. Therefore, this probability of the intersection will be equal to the product of the probabilities. So, that way, this probability is equal to limit n tends to infinity of the product probability of A_j complement j going from n to infinity.

And now we use the result that probability of A_j complement is $1 - P(A_j)$. So, that way we establish the result.

(Refer Slide Time: 25:19)

$$\begin{aligned}
 P(A^c) &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \prod_{j=n}^{\infty} (1 - P(A_j)) \\
 &\leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \prod_{j=n}^{\infty} e^{-P(A_j)} \\
 &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} e^{-\sum_{j=n}^{\infty} P(A_j)} = 0
 \end{aligned}$$

$1 - x \leq e^{-x}$
 $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P(A_j) \rightarrow \infty$
 $P(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) = 1$

Because $\sum_{j=n}^{\infty} P(A_j) = \infty$ whenever $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P(A_j) = \infty$.

$\therefore P(A) = 1$

What is what we have established that is probability of a complement is equal to limit of the product of this sequence that is $1 - P(A_j)$, j going from n to infinity. So, this is $P(A)$ probability of a complement; now we can use one result that $1 - x$ $1 - x$ is always less than equal to e to the power minus x . So, this we can prove easily.

So, this result we will be using here therefore, what we will get that $1 - P(A_j)$ that will be less than equal to therefore, we can write that this limit is less than equal to limit n tends to infinity a product of the sequence e to the power minus $P(A_j)$ because this is our $1 - x$ that is less than e to the power minus x . So, that way this is the product of the sequence e to the power P of A_j , j going from n to infinity now this product

exponential. So, that way, we can take this sum here. So, limit n tends to infinity e to the power summation of $P A_j$, j going from n to infinity with this minus sign.

Now, again we are given that these sequence this sequence summation of P of A_j , j going from 1 to infinity that is diverging sequence. Then if we consider any tail part j going from n to infinity, this sum also will become infinity. Therefore, this will be e to the power minus infinity that will be equal to 0.

So, this is the result we used that is if summation $P A_j$, j is equal to 1 to infinity is equal to infinity, then this any tail some if we consider that will be also infinity. So, we have got P of a complement is 0 therefore, P of a will be equal to 1 ; that means, what we have established probability of \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity that is equal to 1 what what is the constraint that this sequence A_n sequence must be mutually independent and summation of probability of A_j , j is equal to 1 to infinity if this sum diverges then probability of this limiting event is equal to 1.

Therefore we have established the border Borrel Cantelli lemmas it has two part; what are two parts?

(Refer Slide Time: 28:38)

Handwritten notes of the Borel-Cantelli lemmas:

(a) If $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P(A_j) < \infty$
 $P(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) = 0$

(b) If A_j 's are mutually independent,
 and $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P(A_j) \rightarrow \infty$
 $P(\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n) = 1$

So, let us recapitulate. So, a; first one is that is. So, if summation of P of A_j , j going from 1 to infinity if this is diverging, this is converging then probability of the event \limsup of A_n as n tends to infinity that is equal to 0 and part B if A_j s are mutually independent.

We know what is mutually independent any combination of events, if we consider they are independent, they are joint probabilities product of the individual probability

So, if A_j 's are mutually independent and summation of $P A_j$, j going from 1 to infinity if that diverges then probability of \limsup of A_n . This is $\limsup \limsup$ of A_n as n tends to infinity that is equal to 1. So, these results will be used at the background for the next topics next topic will be considering that is convergence of a sequence of random variables.

Thank you.